

**Part II**  
**Consultants' Reports**

# Contents

List of Figures .....iii

**Chapter A:** The Changing Population of the District of Columbia, 1990–1996: An Analysis of Results From the Greater Washington Consumer Survey, *George Grier* .....1

**Chapter B:** The Effect of Taxes on Economic Development, *Stephen T. Mark, Therese J. McGuire, and Leslie E. Papke* .....24

**Chapter C:** The Effect of Taxes on Employment and Population in the Washington Area, *Stephen T. Mark, Therese J. McGuire, and Leslie E. Papke*.....52

**Chapter D:** D.C.: A Capitalist City? A Preliminary Analysis of the New Federal Tax Incentives for the District of Columbia, *Martin A. Sullivan*.....78

**Chapter E:** Real Property Taxation, *John H. Bowman*.....118

**Chapter F:** Tangible Personal Property Taxation, *John H. Bowman*.....202

**Chapter G:** An Analysis of the Graded Property Tax, *Robert M. Schwab and Amy Rehder Harris*.....218

**Chapter H:** Sales Taxes in the District of Columbia: Current Conditions and Policy Options, *William F. Fox*.....260

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Chapter I:</b> The District of Columbia’s Individual Income Tax: Structure, Characteristics, and Policy Alternatives, <i>Robert P. Strauss</i> .....               | 314 |
| <b>Chapter J:</b> Business Franchise and Insurance Taxes in the D.C. Tax System, <i>Joseph J. Cordes and Harry S. Watson</i> .....                                    | 380 |
| <b>Chapter K:</b> Taxation of Telecommunications in the District of Columbia, <i>David Meyer</i> .....  | 442 |
| <b>Chapter L:</b> Tax Policy Review for the Electric and Natural Gas Utility Industries in the District of Columbia, <i>Rodney D. Green and Daniel Muhammad</i> ..... | 482 |
| <b>Chapter M:</b> Nontax Revenues in the District of Columbia, Current Practices and Future Prospects, <i>Michael E. Bell and James O’Keeffe</i> .....                | 510 |
| <b>Chapter N:</b> Earmarking Tax Revenues in the District of Columbia: A Description and Evaluation, <i>Mark I. Gripentrog</i> .....                                  | 534 |
| <b>Appendices:</b>  |     |
| <b>Appendix II-A:</b> District of Columbia Tax Comparisons <i>Philip M. Dearborn</i> .....  | 556 |
| <b>Appendix II-B:</b> A Distributional Analysis of the District of Columbia Tax System, <i>Michael Ettlinger</i> .....  | 570 |
| <b>Appendix II-C:</b> Illustrative Business Tax Liabilities Under Current Law and a Business Activities Tax, <i>Coopers &amp; Lybrand L.L.P.</i> .....                | 582 |

# List of Figures

| <i>Figure</i> | <i>Page</i>   |
|---------------|---|
| A-1           | Number of People per Household.....5  |
| A-2           | Number of Children per Household.....6  |
| A-3           | D.C. Owners and Renters.....7   |
| A-4           | Race of Householder.....7   |
| A-5           | Household Income — Current Dollars.....9  |
| A-6           | Household Income — Constant Dollars.....10  |
| A-7           | Age of Household Members.....11   |
| A-8           | Households by Ward.....12   |
| A-9           | Destinations of Out-Movers.....14   |
| A-10          | Out-Movers, by Household Size.....16  |
| A-11          | Number of Children in Households Moving from D.C.<br>to the Suburbs.....17  |
| A-12          | Out-Movers, by Income Group.....18  |
| A-13          | Educational Levels of Household Heads Moving From<br>D.C. to Suburbs.....19   |
| B-1           | Population, per Capita Income, and Total Income in<br>D.C. and Selected Suburban Counties.....27                    |
| B-2           | D.C. Individual Income Tax Revenue.....28   |
| B-3           | D.C. Employment.....29  |
| B-4           | Annual Average Unemployment Rates.....30  |
| B-5           | Suburban Maryland Employment.....31   |
| B-6           | Suburban Virginia Employment.....32   |
| B-7           | D.C. Metropolitan Area Employment.....33  |
| B-8           | Tax Rates in the D.C. Metropolitan Area.....34  |
| B-9           | Econometric Studies of Tax Effects.....40   |
| C-1           | Population Growth for 22 Cities and Their<br>Metropolitan Areas.....55  |
| C-2           | Employment Growth Rates by Sector for 22 Cities<br>and Their Metropolitan Areas.....56                              |
| C-3           | Real per Capita Income Growth Rates and Real per Capita<br>Income for 22 Cities and Their Metropolitan Areas.....59 |
| C-4           | Growth Rates for the Seven Cities and Their<br>Metropolitan Areas.....60  |
| C-5           | OLS Regression: Population Growth Rate.....64   |
| C-6           | OLS Regression: Growth Rate in Private Employment.....68  |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| C-7  | Sectoral OLS Regressions: Employment Growth Rate.....  | 72  |
| D-1  | New D.C. Tax Benefits Vary According to Poverty<br>Level of Census Tract .....   | 81  |
| D-2  | D.C. by Degree of Poverty .....  | 82  |
| D-3  | Greater Incentives for High-Wage Employees to<br>Work Part Time .....  | 92  |
| D-4  | Work Opportunity Tax Credit as a Percentage of<br>Wages for Youth Working Full Time at \$6.50 per Hour .....   | 106 |
| D-5  | Businesses and Property Eligible for Major D.C. Tax Incentives .....   | 108 |
| E-1  | State and Local Property Taxation in D.C., Md., Va.,<br>and the U.S.....   | 121 |
| E-2  | Real Property Tax Levies, Collections, and Delinquencies .....   | 123 |
| E-3  | D.C. Real Estate Assessed Values; Percent Distribution<br>of Assessed Value .....  | 125 |
| E-4  | D.C. Total Real Property Assessed Value .....  | 126 |
| E-5  | D.C. Nominal Real Property Tax Percentage Rates.....   | 128 |
| E-6  | Hypothetical Example of Assessment-Sales Ratio Calculations .....  | 135 |
| E-7  | D.C. Sales, Median Assessment-Sales Ratios, and Coefficients<br>of Dispersion .....  | 141 |
| E-8  | D.C. Single-Family Residential Sales, Median<br>Assessment-Sales Ratios, and Coefficients of Dispersion.....   | 143 |
| E-9  | Number of Sales, Median Assessment-Sales Ratios, and<br>Coefficients of Dispersion for Nonresidential Property .....   | 145 |
| E-10 | Distribution of Sales by Assessment-Sales Ratio<br>Class and Property Type .....   | 146 |
| E-11 | Range of Assessment to Sales Ratios .....  | 147 |
| E-12 | Hypothetical Example of Assessment-Sales Ratio Calculations .....  | 148 |
| E-13 | Coefficient of Dispersion .....  | 150 |
| E-14 | Provisions of General Property Tax Circuit Breaker .....   | 155 |
| E-15 | Provisions of Property Tax Circuit Breaker Credit for Persons<br>at Least 62 Years Old, or Blind or Disabled .....   | 156 |
| E-16 | Tax as Percentage of Income for Nonelderly Class 1 Residential<br>Property Owners, With No Tax Relief Other Than Classification ...  | 161 |
| E-17 | Tax as Percentage of Income for Nonelderly Class 1 Residential<br>Property Owners, After Current \$30,000 Homestead Exemption<br>With No Property Tax Relief Other Than Classification.....    | 162 |
| E-18 | Tax as Percentage of Income for Nonelderly Class 1 Residential<br>Property Owners, With Current District General Circuit Breaker,<br>but No Property Tax Relief Other Than Classification..... | 164 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| E-19 | Effects of Proposed Sliding-Scale Circuit Breaker .....                                      | 165 |
| E-20 | Amount of Tax Reduction Under Proposed Circuit Breaker .....                                 | 167 |
| E-21 | Net Tax Amounts Under Proposed Circuit Breaker .....   | 168 |
| E-22 | Net Tax as Percent of Income Under Proposed Sliding-Scale<br>Circuit Breaker .....           | 170 |
| E-23 | Hypothetical Examples of Effects of Triennial Assessment<br>With Changes Phased In .....     | 175 |
| E-24 | Effects of Triennial Assessment and Average Annual Change<br>in Value With Phase-In .....    | 178 |
| E-25 | Effects of Triennial Assessment and Average Annual Change<br>in Value Without Phase-In ..... | 181 |
| E-26 | Effects of Triennial Assessment and Actual Annual Change<br>in Value With Phase-In .....     | 183 |
| E-27 | Effects of Triennial Assessment With Annual Change<br>in Value Without Phase-In .....        | 185 |
| E-28 | Long-Term Effect of Triennial Assessments .....  | 186 |
| E-29 | Assessment Appeals per Tax Year .....  | 190 |
| E-30 | Effects of BRPAA Decisions .....   | 190 |
| E-31 | Number of BRPAA Property Tax Appeal Cases and Estimated<br>Revenue Impact .....              | 192 |
| F-1  | Tax Status of Major Categories of Tangible Personal Property .....                           | 205 |
| F-2  | Personal Property as Percent of Net Locally Assessed Taxable<br>Value .....                  | 206 |
| F-3  | Personal Property Tax Rate, Revenue, and Bases .....   | 208 |
| F-4  | Tangible Personal Property Tax Revenue as Percent of Various<br>Revenue Measures .....       | 209 |
| F-5  | Annual Growth Rates of Various Revenue Sources .....   | 211 |
| F-6  | Tax Treatment of Tangible Personal Property in the D.C.<br>Metropolitan Area .....           | 213 |
| G-1  | Standard Property Tax, Graded Property Tax, and Pure Land Tax .....                          | 220 |
| G-2  | Pittsburgh Property Tax Rates .....  | 225 |
| G-3  | Average Annual Value of Building Permits .....   | 226 |
| G-4  | Summary of Alternative Tax Policies .....  | 234 |
| G-5  | Tax Rates Under the Baseline and Five Alternatives .....                                     | 236 |
| G-6  | Tax Revenues by Class Under the Five Alternatives .....                                      | 237 |
| G-7  | Class 1: Residential, Owner-Occupied — Relative Property<br>Tax Revenues .....               | 238 |
| G-8  | Class 2: Residential, Tenant-Occupied — Relative Property<br>Tax Revenues .....              | 240 |
| G-9  | Class 3: Hotel and Motel — Relative Property Tax Revenues .....                              | 242 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| G-10 | Class 4: Commercial — Relative Property Tax Revenues .....                                 | 244 |
| G-11 | Class 5: Vacant Land — Relative Property Tax Revenues.....                                 | 246 |
| G-12 | Alternative Three: Relative Property Tax Revenues .....                                    | 248 |
| G-13 | Alternative Four: Relative Property Tax Revenues .....                                     | 249 |
| G-14 | Alternative Five: Relative Property Tax Revenues .....                                     | 250 |
| H-1  | Exempt Sales as Percent of Total Sales.....  | 264 |
| H-2  | 1996 Exempt Sales as Percent of Total Reported Sales for<br>Selected Industries.....       | 265 |
| H-3  | Taxation of Services in D.C., Md., and Va.....   | 266 |
| H-4  | State and Local Sales Tax Rates.....   | 268 |
| H-5  | Number of State Sales Tax Rate Increases by Year .....                                     | 270 |
| H-6  | Distribution of Taxable Sales by Rate, Percentage of Base at<br>Different Rates .....      | 271 |
| H-7  | Distribution of Taxable Sales by Tax Rate .....  | 272 |
| H-8  | D.C. Sales and Use Tax Collections .....   | 273 |
| H-9  | Distribution of D.C. General Fund Taxes.....   | 274 |
| H-10 | D.C. and U.S. State Sales and Use Tax Collections as Percent<br>of Personal Income.....    | 275 |
| H-11 | Elasticity and Buoyancy Estimates and Growth Rates for the<br>D.C. Sales and Use Tax ..... | 276 |
| H-12 | Personal Consumption Expenditures.....   | 277 |
| H-13 | Growth in Real and Nominal Sales and Use Tax Collections.....                              | 279 |
| H-14 | D.C. Sales Tax Payments as Percent of Income.....  | 282 |
| H-15 | Estimated D.C. Sales Taxes by Income Group.....  | 283 |
| H-16 | Sales Tax Payments as Percent of Expenditures.....   | 284 |
| H-17 | Percent of Area Retail Sales in Different Subregions .....                                 | 288 |
| H-18 | Estimated Tax Collections.....   | 291 |
| H-19 | Cigarette Tax Rates .....  | 292 |
| H-20 | Gasoline Tax Rates .....   | 293 |
| I-1  | Large Cities Losing Population, 1970–1994.....   | 317 |
| I-2  | Individual Income Taxes as Percent of Personal Income .....                                | 318 |
| I-3  | D.C. Tax Filers in 1989 and 1995.....  | 324 |
| I-4  | 1995 D.C. Tax Liability .....  | 325 |
| I-5  | D.C. Income Tax Rate Schedule, Form D-40.....  | 327 |
| I-6  | Federal Poverty Line and Gross Tax Entry Points.....                                       | 328 |
| I-7  | D.C. Effective Personal Income Tax Rates .....   | 330 |
| I-8  | 1995 D.C. Itemizers: Effective Tax Rates With and Without<br>Federal Offset .....          | 332 |
| I-9  | Personal Income Tax Burden in 1996 .....   | 333 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| I-10 | Trend in Relative Growth of Numbers of D.C., Md., and Va. Federal Returns.....           | 334 |
| I-11 | Estimated Earnings of D.C. Residents.....  | 335 |
| I-12 | Sum of Estimated Earnings and Capital Income.....  | 336 |
| I-13 | Composition of D.C. Resident Income Base.....  | 337 |
| I-14 | Federal AGI for D.C., Md., and Va. ....  | 338 |
| I-15 | Resident Employment Levels and Wages.....  | 339 |
| I-16 | D.C. Federal Tax Returns.....  | 340 |
| I-17 | Number of Federal Returns: D.C., Md., and Va. —<br>\$15,000–\$30,000 Income Group.....   | 341 |
| I-18 | Number of Federal Returns: D.C., Md., and Va. —<br>\$50,000–\$75,000 Income Group.....   | 342 |
| I-19 | Number of Federal Returns: D.C., Md., and Va. —<br>\$100,000–\$200,000 Income Group..... | 343 |
| I-20 | Total Federal Tax Returns of D.C. In-Migrants and<br>Out-Migrants.....                   | 344 |
| I-21 | Average Exemptions per Return of D.C. In-Migrants and<br>Out-Migrants.....               | 345 |
| I-22 | Net of Total Exemptions of D.C. In-Migrants and Out-Migrants...                          | 346 |
| I-23 | Federal AGI per Return of D.C. In-Migrants and<br>Out-Migrants.....                      | 347 |
| I-24 | Federal Returns Moving Into D.C. From Md. ....   | 348 |
| I-25 | Federal Returns Moving Into D.C. From Va. ....   | 349 |
| I-26 | Federal Returns Moving From D.C. to Md. ....   | 350 |
| I-27 | Federal Returns Moving From D.C. to Va. ....   | 351 |
| I-28 | D.C. Tax Return Filing Characteristics of Movers Out of<br>and Into the District.....    | 352 |
| I-29 | Incomes of New and Continuing D.C. Residents.....  | 353 |
| I-30 | Distribution of Federal AGI and Average D.C. Taxes per<br>Federal AGI Class.....         | 354 |
| I-31 | D.C. Out-Migrants and In-Migrants, by Zip Code, as<br>Percent of 1989 Tax Returns.....   | 355 |
| I-32 | Effects of Growth in Crime on Decline in D.C. Taxpayers.....                             | 356 |
| I-33 | Effects of Growth in Crime on Number of D.C. Taxpayers<br>Leaving D.C. ....              | 357 |
| I-34 | Analysis of Piggybacking Proposals, Surcharge on Federal Tax .....                       | 359 |
| I-35 | Effect of a 28 Percent Federal Surcharge on 1995 D.C.<br>Tax Rates.....                  | 360 |
| I-36 | Effect of a 36.7 Percent Federal Surcharge on 1995 D.C.<br>Tax Rates.....                | 361 |



|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| I-37 | Distributional Effects of Replacing D.C. Income Tax With a Simplified Tax, 1995 Federal Taxpayers With D.C. Returns (Federal Filing Unit, Mandatory D.C. Standard Deduction and Exemption Amounts, and D.C. Rate Structure) ..... | 363 |
| I-38 | Distributional Effects of Replacing D.C. Income Tax With a Simplified Tax, 1995 Federal Taxpayers With D.C. Returns (Federal Filing Unit and Mandatory Federal Standard Deduction and Exemption Amounts) .....                    | 364 |
| I-39 | Distribution of Taxes Under 1995 Law and Reform Alternative   |     |
|      | Panel A: Single.....  | 366 |
|      | Panel B: Married Filing Jointly.....  | 367 |
|      | Panel C: Married Filing Separately.....   | 368 |
|      | Panel D: Head of Household.....   | 369 |
| J-1  | Sources of D.C. Tax Revenue.....  | 382 |
| J-2  | States With Corporate Income Taxes .....  | 386 |
| J-3  | Main Features of Corporate Franchise Taxes in the D.C. Area .....   | 388 |
| J-4  | Number of Returns Filed by D.C. Businesses.....   | 392 |
| J-5  | Distribution of Corporate Franchise Tax Payments by Industry.....   | 394 |
| J-6  | Distribution of Corporate Franchise Tax Payments by Broad Sector.....   | 398 |
| J-7  | Industries With the Largest Share of Corporate Franchise Tax Payments.....  | 400 |
| J-8  | Share of Corporate Franchise Payments by Broad Sector .....   | 401 |
| J-9  | Share of Corporate Franchise Payments by Industry.....  | 402 |
| J-10 | Distribution of Corporate Franchise Tax Returns .....   | 403 |
| J-11 | Distribution of Corporate Franchise Tax Payments Among Businesses With Taxable Income .....   | 404 |
| J-12 | Unincorporated Business Tax Payments .....  | 405 |
| J-13 | Unincorporated Business Tax Returns .....   | 406 |
| J-14 | Stability of Business Tax Revenue.....  | 407 |
| J-15 | Annual Percent Change in Corporate Franchise Tax Receipts .....   | 408 |
| J-16 | Additional D.C. Corporate Franchise Taxes Relative to Additional Total D.C. Business Taxes for a Sample Biotechnology Manufacturing Company .....   | 409 |
| J-17 | Additional D.C. Corporate Franchise Taxes Relative to Additional Total D.C. Business Taxes for a Sample Nonmanufacturing R&D Company .....  | 410 |
| J-18 | Effective Tax Rates of Unincorporated Businesses .....  | 412 |
| J-19 | Effects of Changing Apportionment Formulas.....   | 418 |
| J-20 | Corporate Value-Added Tax (VAT) Base .....  | 428 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| K-1  | Major Provisions of the <i>Telecommunications Act of 1996</i> .....                 | 448 |
| K-2  | Significant Events in D.C. Taxation of Telecommunications .....                     | 450 |
| K-3  | Dilemmas Facing Telecommunications Tax Policy .....                                 | 451 |
| K-4  | Role of Telecommunications in D.C. ....   | 454 |
| K-5  | Location Quotients for Telecommunications<br>Employment in D.C. ....                | 455 |
| K-6  | Large Telecommunications Firms Headquartered<br>in the D.C. Metropolitan Area ..... | 456 |
| K-7  | Employment in Telecommunications-Dependent<br>Industries in D.C. ....               | 457 |
| K-8  | Factors Important to Business Relocation .....                                      | 458 |
| K-9  | Major Taxes and Fees Applied to Telecommunications<br>Services in D.C. ....         | 460 |
| K-10 | History of Toll Telecommunications Tax Collections .....                            | 461 |
| K-11 | Definitions of Service Categories .....   | 472 |
| L-1  | Tax Rates for Utilities .....   | 485 |
| L-2  | Category of Tax as Share of Total Tax Payment .....                                 | 486 |
| L-3  | PEPCO's Taxes .....   | 488 |
| L-4  | BG&E's Taxes .....  | 489 |
| L-5  | VEPCO's Taxes .....   | 490 |
| L-6  | Aggregate Tax Burden on Electric Utilities .....                                    | 490 |
| L-7  | Importance of Electric Utility Tax Payments .....                                   | 491 |
| L-8  | PEPCO's Taxes in the District and Maryland .....                                    | 491 |
| L-9  | Washington Gas Taxes, Sales, and Tax Rate .....                                     | 492 |
| L-10 | Washington Gas Taxes .....  | 493 |
| L-11 | Washington Gas Revenues per Therm .....   | 494 |
| L-12 | Cents per Kilowatt-Hour Sold .....  | 497 |
| M-1  | D.C. General Fund Local Source Revenues Shares .....                                | 512 |
| M-2  | District of Columbia Revenues .....   | 514 |
| M-3  | Revenue Sources as Shares of Total Revenue .....                                    | 515 |
| M-4  | Utility Revenue .....   | 516 |
| M-5  | Miscellaneous General Revenue .....   | 518 |
| M-6  | State Current Charge .....  | 519 |
| M-7  | Relative Importance of Nontax Revenues .....  | 520 |
| M-8  | City Current Charge .....   | 521 |
| M-9  | Current Charges Revenues as Share of Expenditures<br>by Category and State .....    | 522 |
| M-10 | Current Charges Revenues as Share of Expenditures<br>by Category and City .....     | 523 |
| N-1  | Historical Data on Earmarking Among States .....                                    | 538 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| N-2  | Number of States Earmarking Specific Taxes .....  | 539 |
| N-3  | Summary of D.C. Earmarked Revenues.....   | 543 |
| N-4  | D.C. Earmarked Revenues.....  | 544 |
| N-5  | Rate Structure for Arena Fee.....   | 548 |
| N-6  | Fiscal Year 1996 District Tax Revenues.....   | 550 |
| II-a | Composition of State Revenues.....  | 558 |
| II-b | Tax Base per Capita Real Property Tax .....   | 559 |
| II-c | An Interstate Comparison of Sales Tax Bases .....   | 560 |
| II-d | Income Tax Bases in the D.C. Area.....  | 561 |
| II-e | Distribution of Income Tax Base.....  | 561 |
| II-f | Ratio of Commercial Effective Tax Rate to Owner-Occupied<br>Residential Effective Tax Rate.....   | 563 |
| II-g | State and Local Revenue, per Capita and as<br>Percentage of Personal Income.....  | 564 |
| II-h | Current Law and Changes Recommended by the<br>D.C. Tax Revision Commission as Shares of 1998 Family<br>Income for All Taxpayers.....                | 577 |
| II-i | Current Law and Changes Recommended by the<br>D.C. Tax Revision Commission as Shares of 1998 Family<br>Income for Married Nonelderly Taxpayers..... | 578 |
| II-j | Current Law and Changes Recommended by the<br>D.C. Tax Revision Commission as Shares of 1998 Income<br>for Unmarried Nonelderly Taxpayers.....      | 579 |
| II-k | Current Law and Changes Recommended by the<br>D.C. Tax Revision Commission as Shares of 1998 Family<br>Income for Elderly Taxpayers.....            | 580 |
| II-l | Examples of an Illustrative Business's Tax Liability<br>Under Current Law Tax vs. Business Activities Tax.....                                      | 587 |